

**Spotlight on Role-play:
Interrogating the theory and practice
of role-play in adult education from
a theatre arts perspective**

by

Kate Collier

PhD thesis

Submitted 2005

Students are required to make a declaration when they submit the thesis for examination. Here is a recommended form of words.

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. R. Calver', is written over a horizontal line.

Acknowledgements

At times I thought I would never complete this thesis. It has been a long project. I would therefore like to acknowledge some of the people who helped me see this PhD journey through to the end. In keeping with the topic of this thesis I would also like to note the roles they played in supporting me during its development.

My supervisors and mentors: I would like to thank Mike Newman and Lee Andresen for being very patient and always having faith in me and my research. Both have been wonderful supervisor role-models. They stimulated and challenged my thinking throughout and have given me invaluable feedback. I have learnt so much from them from the many discussions we have had over the years. They have been inspirational mentors.

Members of the UTS Faculty of Education Writing Group – experimenters and critical friends: This writing group met for two years (1998/9) and was instrumental in helping me gain confidence as a writer and publisher. The group provided a safe forum for members to experiment with their writing, and their feedback and support helped me gain the confidence to publish my first academic articles. These became the basis for my thesis.

My colleagues at UTS – supportive team members: My research is closely linked to the work I do at UTS and the colleagues I work with there. Their

influence on my thinking and practice has been an important part in the development of my research. I would like particularly to thank Elyssebeth Leigh who began her EdD at the same time as me but finished first and has been helping me catch up with her ever since! There is one colleague, Hank Schaafsma, who did not live to see me complete my thesis, but who was one of the first to encourage me to take on this research.

My husband – conscience and agitator: I lost the bet and he finished his PhD more than a year before I did. Since then he has been my conscience reminding me how important it is that I finish my PhD rather than go to the theatre again. I am grateful for him being there for me and keeping faith.

Family and friends – carers and supporters: I would especially like to acknowledge Tom and Ruth, my father and mother, who were the first to encourage me in my love of learning and the theatre. Also my brother Paul, who was my first PhD role-model and who still can't understand how it has taken me so long!

Thanks to my friend Betty Sheppard whose idea for a 'ground-breaking' joint PhD application initiated this whole journey. Her continuing support over numerous glasses of wine has been an important part of my learning process. Talking of good wine, thanks to Cedric Sandford – special friend and encourager. Sorry I didn't finish in time.

SAGSET – nurturer: I have been a member of this professional organisation for 20 years and they have, especially through their conferences and publications, made an important contribution to my research and professional development.

Finally I would like to thank the University of Technology for making this research possible.

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	i
Figures	viii
Abstract	ix
Chapter 1. Introduction: The background to the research	1
The story behind the research question.....	1
Educational and professional influences.....	4
Focus on role-play	7
Identifying multi-disciplinary perspectives.....	10
Theatre arts	11
Drama-in-education	17
Dramatherapy	21
Adult education and experience-based learning	22
The Emotions.....	24
Ethics	26
Other sources.....	30
Chapter 2. Methodology.....	31
Adopting the role of a scholarly researcher	31
Putting on the 'mantle of the expert'	37
Developing my research through 'writing in role'	42
How publications contributed to my writing of this thesis	45
An annotated bibliography (Appendix 1).....	47

Chapter 3. The problem with role-play	53
What is role-play and why use it?	53
Problems of using role-play in adult education	62
Some examples of problems that arise in simulation and games	63
The damage caused by inappropriate categorisation and structural flaws	67
Problems with motivation and issues of engagement and disengagement	68
Concerns about play-acting, inappropriate facilitator intervention and de-briefing	70
An alternative view of why problems occur in role-play in adult education	72
The problem of situating role-play within Adult Education	78
The limitations of positioning role-play within experience-based learning	78
Philosophical confusion	85
A brief history of simulation and games	92
 Chapter 4. Why connect drama and theatre arts and role-play in adult education?	 97
Supposition 1: Theatre is about entertainment not education	98
Learning from theatre	100
Supposition 2: Drama-in-education is concerned with children, not adults	107
Supposition 3: Role-play is concerned with reproducing social roles, not theatre and acting	117
Goffman and role-theory	122
Moreno and psychodrama	126
 Chapter 5. The art of role-play	 131
What is art?	132
The art of theatre	135
Role-play and theatre art	142
Art and everyday experience	146

Chapter 6. The art of drama-in-education.....154

A sense of time	155
Quality of meaning.....	155
Quality of feeling	156
The actor as audience: self-spectatorship	158
Suspension of form.....	160
The form of drama	164
Tension	166
Focus	167
Surprise and contrast.....	168
Symbolisation	170
Metaxis: the interaction between the real and the fictional in drama	172
The gap between the real and the fiction.....	177

Chapter 7. Putting theory into practice.....180

1. Setting the stage.....	181
Playback Theatre and the delineation of 'intentional space'	184
The ritual space of 'Playback Theatre'	185
Transforming everyday experience into theatre	190
The importance of beginnings and endings	194
What role-play can learn from Playback Theatre	196
2. Frame-Analysis and dramatic focus.....	200
3. Dramatic Conventions and dramatic focus	207
'Yuppies Go Home'—the use of dramatic conventions in role-play.....	215
4. Bolton's model of role-play and dramatic timing	223
Marking 'dramatic time' in role-play.....	226
5. Forum theatre, dramatic symbols and dramatic tension	231
The background to Forum Theatre.....	232
The structure of Forum Theatre	235
How theatre form is used to engage and detach participants in Forum Theatre	240

Forum Theatre in Practice.....	243
Finding a model for role-play.....	244
Chapter 8. The learning benefits of using role-play as an arts strategy..	249
1. Can role-play help participants learn content and add complexity to the meaning that can be derived from that content?	251
2. Can role-play stimulate aesthetic learning?	262
3. Is role-play concerned with therapeutic learning?.....	267
The power of projection.....	270
The practical application of projective techniques.....	274
Can dramatherapy help us to understand what can be learned through role-play ?	277
4. Transformative learning	280
Role-play—putting the art back into the adult education curriculum	286
Chapter 9. The consequences of the research.....	291
Does this theory have legs? Or: How I put my theory into practice.	291
How can my research be of use to other adult educators?.....	298
Pointers for role play practice in education	299
What difference has this research made to the field? How has it moved things forward?	304
Appendices	310
Appendix 1. Published Articles.	310
Appendix 2. Drama Conventions – a quick reference guide	311
Mather (Turning Drama Conventions into Images, 1996).....	311
Carey (Drama Volume 4 No. 1, 1995)	314
Owens and Barber, 1997 (Dramaworks)	319
Appendix 3. Newspaper Stimulus ‘Yuppies Go Home’	326
Bibliography.....	327

Figures

Fig. 1: Lewin's Cycle (Kolb 1984).....	Ch 3	p. 81
Fig. 2: Experiential Learning Methods (Henry 1996)	Ch 3	p. 90
Fig. 3: Goffman's Purity of Social Occasions (Heathcote 1984)	Ch 4	p. 124
Fig. 4: O'Toole's elements of dramatic form (O'Toole 1992)	Ch 6	p. 165
Fig. 5: Playback Theatre Set-up (Salas 1996)	Ch 7	p. 188
Fig. 6: Frame Role-distance model (Heathcote & Carroll 1986)	Ch 7	p. 203
Fig. 7: Heathcote's and Gilham's Levels of Meaning (Eriksson & Jantzen 1992)	Ch 8	p. 254

Abstract

This thesis addresses the use of role-play in adult education. It is a piece of scholarly research that aims to further develop ideas of theory and practice in this area. It is also hoped that this research will provide a framework for practice that will encourage both adult educators and learners to feel more confident using role-play as a learning approach.

The research arose from problems that the author experienced in her practice as an adult educator using role-play in adult vocational education training programs in higher education. The key problem identified was how to involve participants in a role-play but at the same time encourage their critical awareness so that they could learn from the experience. Questions of involvement and its converse, detachment, also relate to the *emotional* content of learning, and how this can be safely and productively managed in a role-play situation.

Role-play in adult education is an under-theorised area, and the available literature offers inadequate answers to the problems identified above. There is, however, a great deal of research and information about role-play in theatre arts and related areas such as drama-in-education and dramatherapy, but this is rarely referred to in adult education. This may be because role-play is often presented as an aspect of simulation and gaming, which are strategies that tend to adopt a scientific rather than an arts approach to learning. Also, since much of the theatre arts literature that is relevant to role-play comes

from drama-in-education, it refers to child or adolescent learning rather than adult education.

This thesis argues that the positioning of role-play in the theoretical field of simulation and gaming is limiting. It proposes that it would be more productive if role-play could be seen as a theatre arts strategy. It demonstrates the significant benefits role-play could gain from an analysis of the available literature in this area, and how this could beneficially alter the way role-play is conceptualised and practised.

Once role-play is positioned as a theatre arts strategy it is possible to explore how its 'significant form' engages participants, yet also enables them to remain critically detached from the role-play so they can learn from it. The thesis also presents the proposition that aesthetic learning may have something significant to offer adult education.

Theatre arts can provide a comprehensive framework for conceptualising and using role-play in adult education. If role-play were to be utilised within this framework, then adding an arts perspective to adult education could potentially transform learning in this area.